

**MINUTES**

**OF THE**

**SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS**

**HELD IN THE**

**CONFERENCE ROOM OF THE MELVILLE CIVIC CENTRE**

**AT 6.30PM ON**

**THURSDAY**

**23 MARCH 2017**



**MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS HELD AT THE CITY OF MELVILLE IN THE CONFERENCE ROOM, COMMENCING 6.30PM ON THURSDAY 23 MARCH 2017.**

**1. OFFICIAL OPENING**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, welcomed Ratepayers and Electors of the City of Melville and opened the meeting at 6.30pm.

His Worship the Mayor advised the meeting had been called to discuss "*The proposed new use of the land now occupied by the Mt Pleasant Bowling Club in Bedford Road, Ardross*"

**2. PRESENT**

His Worship the Mayor R Aubrey

**COUNCILLORS**

Deputy Mayor R Aubrey  
Cr D Macphail  
Cr N Pazolli, Cr C Schuster  
Cr J Barton  
Cr M Woodall, Cr C Robartson  
Cr P Phelan  
Cr N Foxton, Cr T Barling

**WARD**

City  
City  
Applecross/Mount Pleasant  
Bicton/Attadale  
Bull Creek/Leeming  
Palmyra/Melville/Willagee  
University

**IN ATTENDANCE**

Dr S Silcox  
Mr M Tieleman  
Ms C Young  
Mr J Christie  
Mr S Cope  
Mr L Hitchcock  
Mr J Clark

Mr J Rae  
Mr D Cracknell

Ms J Arbel  
Mr N Fimmano  
Ms C Newman

Mr W Thornton  
Ms K Elliss  
Ms K Thornton

Chief Executive Officer  
Director Corporate Services  
Director Community Development  
Director Technical Services  
Director Urban Planning  
Executive Manager Legal Services  
Governance and Compliance Program  
Manager  
Strategic Property Executive  
Senior Strategic Urban Property  
Planner  
Strategic Communications Advisor  
Governance and Property Officer  
Executive Support & Governance  
Officer  
Civic Facilities Coordinator  
Administration Officer  
Administration Officer

At the commencement of the meeting there were 67 electors of the City and one member of the press in attendance.

**3. APOLOGIES**

Cr G Wieland                      Bicton/Attadale Ward

**4. LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Nil.

**5. INTRODUCTION OF ELECTED MEMBERS AND OFFICERS**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, introduced Elected Members and Senior Staff to the meeting.

**6. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Nil.

**6.1 FINANCIAL INTERESTS**

Nil.

**6.2 DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST THAT MAY CAUSE A CONFLICT**

Nil.

## 7. BUSINESS

### 7.1 NOTICE OF SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS

The following Notice of Meeting was advertised in the West Australian Newspaper on Wednesday 8 March 2017 and the Melville Times Community Newspaper on Tuesday, 14 March 2017 in addition to being displayed on public notice boards at all the City of Melville libraries and the Civic Centre. The notice read:

### **“Special Meeting of Electors**

**Thursday, 23 March 2017**

A Special Meeting of Electors of the City of Melville will be held in the Conference Room of the Civic Centre, 10 Almondbury Road, Booragoon, commencing at 6.30pm on Thursday, 23 March 2017 to consider a request signed by 123 electors to discuss the following:-

***The proposed new use of the land now occupied by the Mt Pleasant Bowling Club in Bedford Road, Ardross, because;***

- A. The Council has failed in their obligation to properly consult the local community in the development of plans that will have impact on our community, and in doing so,***
- B. The Council is failing to protect open space and the designated recreation, and social/community areas for future generations, and***
- C. The Council should consider alternative proposals for, community, recreation and leisure use of the Mt Pleasant Bowling Club site that is compatible with the current Ardross environment.***

Electors and Ratepayers of the City are welcome to attend. Registration will be available from 5.45pm. The Council Meeting Schedule, Agendas and Minutes of all meetings are available at [www.melvillecity.com.au](http://www.melvillecity.com.au).

**Dr Shayne Silcox  
Chief Executive Officer”**

## **7.2 MANNER OF CONDUCT OF THE MEETING**

1. It is a requirement to advise that in the event of an emergency, everyone should take direction from officers who will guide you to the exit points of the building.
2. The Toilets location will be advised.
3. All present are required to sign the attendance register at the entry to the Meeting Room.
4. Each person who participates in a vote or speaks must be an Elector of the City of Melville.
5. The proceedings are being taped for the purpose of production of the minutes and speakers are requested to use the microphones each time they speak.

The Minutes will include a summary of any questions asked and a summary of the response provided.

6. No other audio or visual recording is to be undertaken without the permission of the Presiding Member.
7. Speakers are asked to clearly give their name and address each time they speak.
8. Upon a motion being proposed, each speaker is to address the Chair.
9. Only Electors of the City of Melville may move or second a motion.
10. All addresses are to be limited to a maximum of five (5) minutes. Extension of time is permissible only with the agreement of a simple majority of Electors present (*Local Government (Administration) Regulations 1996 Regulation 17*).
11. No persons are to use offensive or objectionable expressions in reference to any Member, employee of the Council, or any other person (8.3 of Standing Orders).
12. All Elected Members and Directors attend this meeting to observe the proceedings and hear comments from Electors. All questions and comments should be directed to the Mayor who may invite a response from the Chief Executive Officer, Presiding Members of Committees, Directors or Elected Members.

## **8. PRESENTATIONS**

### **8.1 Mr P Johnson, Ardross**

Expressed his concern at the consultation process with the community in relation to moving the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club. In his opinion the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club is successful and widely used by the community.

At 6.43pm – Moved Mr N McKay, Ardross, seconded Mr A Pollard, Mount Pleasant

**That Mr Johnson be granted an extension of time and permitted to speak for a further five minutes.**

At 6.43pm the Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED**

### **8.2 Mr A Pollard, Mount Pleasant**

Expressed concern at the proposed disposal of this site and that he considers that this site should be retained for future generations. The Club is a social hub and widely used by the community and corporate organisations. The community wishes to retain open and usable public spaces.

### **8.3 Mr G Gear, Alfred Cove**

The Mount Pleasant Bowling Club is a vital community centre for Mount Pleasant and the City of Melville. Mr Gear expressed concern at the contents of the information in the City's Lawn Bowls Report.

Mr Gear is seeking a meeting with the new Minister for Local Government and has sent a brief to the Corruption and Crime Commission on this matter.

At 6.59pm – Moved Mr A Pollard, Mount Pleasant, seconded Mr N McKay, Ardross

**That Mr Gear be granted an extension of time and permitted to speak for a further five minutes.**

At 6.59pm the Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED**

At 7.04pm – Moved, Mr A Pollard, Mount Pleasant, seconded Mr M Donraadt, Booragoon

**That Mr Gear be granted a further extension of time and permitted to speak for a further five minutes.**

At 7.04 the Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED**

*At 7.06pm the Mayor called for questions from the meeting.*

## **9. QUESTIONS**

### **9.1 Mr N McKay, Ardross**

#### Question 1

*With regard to the survey that was on the City's website and was also circulated via email, the survey appeared to be biased and did not offer alternatives to enable participants to express their views, why was this?*

#### Response

The Director Urban Planning advised that the City's survey was designed as a result of the November 2016 Council decision, where the Council supported, in principle, the development of the site, including the provision of suitable open space and urban design and lot size comparable with the surrounding neighbourhood.

#### Question 2

*One of the questions was something along the lines of "would you prefer single residential buildings with parklands or would you prefer multi-story buildings less than three stories high?" I didn't like either of the options, but there was no ability to indicate this.*

*Does the Council take into consideration the people that did not complete the survey, or does it just tally up the results for each question?*

#### Response

The Director Community Development advised that the survey tool was responding to the direction that the City had taken. The Council decision was to test what different options were preferred by the local community if the Bowling Club was not there.

### **9.2 Mr K Kelers, Alfred Cove**

#### Question

*With the relocation of the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club, what are the alternative uses considered for the land to be vacated?*

#### Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that that was the purpose of the survey and the consultation process that was currently being undertaken.

*At 7.12pm Mr T Smith was requested to leave the meeting for disruptive behaviour.*

**9.3 Mr Marciano, Alfred Cove**Question 1

*The Melville Bowling Club is affiliated with six other Clubs. How many other Clubs are located at Tompkins Park?*

Response

The Director Community Development advised that the City is working with the relocation committee which comprises both Melville Bowling Club and the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club. The City's discussions are with the Executive Committees of the Clubs (elected to represent the interests of the Clubs). They are the people that have provided the City with the information in terms of financial status, issues around declining numbers and sustainability.

The City is also working collaboratively with a larger group including the current sports at Tompkins Parks (including rugby, cricket, soccer etc) to deliver a sporting and recreation hub.

No Clubs that are currently meeting at the current Bowling Clubs will be displaced. They will be very welcome at the new sporting and recreation facility. There are currently three Clubs located at Tompkins Park.

Question 2

*After the 2015 Council election advice was sought from an Elected Member as to whether the Melville Bowling Club lease could be extended, and they were given the impression that the extension would not be a problem. What has changed?*

Response

The Mayor responded that the Bowling Club Strategy was undertaken and resulted in new information and the Mayor advised the President of the Melville Bowling Club.

The Chief Executive Officer advised that the Council and the City understands the concerns of the community in relation to the issues being discussed and provided broad information on strategies that are presented to the Council to reduce increases to rates and to assist sporting clubs to be sustainable for the longer term.

**9.4 Mr J Cording, Ardross**Question

*Has the amenity provided by the Bowls Club being considered in context of the higher density being delivered around the Booragoon Shopping Centre, has the population increase been taken into consideration?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that the City has in recent years spent approximately \$24,000,000 purchasing 8.8 hectares of public open space through the City. Public Open Space is an issue with higher densities.



**9.4 Mr J Cording, Ardross - continued**

The current Bowling Club site is not public open space. To use the area, you need to be member of the Club. The intention of this project is for 30% of the site to be real public open space.

**9.5 Ms C Kelers, Alfred Cove**Question 1

*Of the three Clubs that are presently located at Tompkins Park are they mostly women, mostly men or an equal balance of each?*

Response

The Director Community Development advised that the Clubs are probably mostly men.

Question 2

*The present sports at Tompkins Park are male dominated and you are now asking two Clubs, that are a mixture of generally older men and women, to move to a very active male dominated sporting centre?*

Response

The Director Community Development advised that the City is working collaboratively with both Bowling Clubs, including female representation, and there has been significant input with regard to the improved amenities at Tompkins Park for the female members. The intention is for an inclusive site.

Question 3

*Is a Wave Park public open space?*

Response

The Mayor responded, no more than a Bowling Club.

Question 4

*Yet it will take up more space?*

Response

The Mayor advised that it will take up more space than the current Bowling Club, but it will not impact on the currently activities on the site.

**9.6 Mr G Crawford, Attadale.**Question

*Where is the financial modelling for the management of the City of Melville? What are the plans to spend the Reserve funds on?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer responded that the City currently has \$1.2 billion of assets. Reserve funds are to ensure management and maintenance of these into the future.

The City also has a Long Term Financial Plan to assist with decision making and the future rating implications.

**9.7 Mr J Holder, Bull Creek**Question 1

*What would be the impact on rates if the Bowling Clubs did not move/amalgamate?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that this is only one component of a large complex proposal and the outcome of proposals at this time is unknown. There is also an involvement at a State level and the future availability and application of funds will not be decided at a State level until there is a better understanding of the overall outcomes.

Question 2

*Is it correct that the City does not know the impact of the proposal?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that until a decision has been made in relation to the development of the site, the outcome is unknown. The City is currently in the process stage and no final decisions have been made.

Question 3

Requested the Councillors to, by show of hands, indicate who would support the motion from the meeting last week?

Response

The Mayor advised that Elected Members cannot pre-commit to a final decision on a matter until they have all the information available to them and they are in a formal meeting where a decision is to be made.

**9.7 Mr N Lavery, Ardross**Question

*Advised that the City of Melville has some of the best facilities and he does not understand why the City of Melville is considering selling/leasing public open space and getting rid of the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club? Why is the City talking about getting rid of Public Open Space and sporting facilities? The increased development in the City means the community needs more area to recreate?*

Response

The Mayor responded that the issues have been addressed by the Chief Executive Officer previously and the City is not considering selling public open space and is looking for options to ensure the longer term viability of sporting clubs in City.

**9.8 Ms E Dawson, Attadale**Question 1

*Do you understand that the ratepayers may not trust the Council's ability to ensure the financial suitability of the City if premium land such as Tompkins Park is valued at \$700,000.*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised, that the land is a restricted purpose site that can only be used for Sport and Recreation and it is an ex-contaminated site that also poses restrictions as to the use of the site. An independent valuation on the land was been sought which takes the restrictions into consideration.

Question 2

*Do you understand that the ratepayers don't think that the financial agreements made by the City are transparent?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that he did understand the concerns of the ratepayers, but the City was required to work within parameters of legislation and is dealing with information that is considered commercially confidential.

Once the decision is made the information may be able to be made available.

**9.9 Mr J Sendzucuk, Ardross**Question

*If the City does not understand what the State Government will charge for the land, what decision will be made if the value of the land is significantly higher than anticipated?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer responded that at this stage it is unknown if the State will sell the land, it may be a decision of the Council to purchase the land. At this stage, it appears that the City and the State may enter into a joint venture to develop the land, however, it is unknown what proceeds, if any, will be allocated to the City of Melville.

**9.10 Mr G Crawford, Attadale**Question

*There is a component of the community that feel that the City is open and accountable enough. Mr Crawford would like to meet with the Director of Corporate Services to review the Long Term Financial Plan and the financial pressures and demands that are placed on the City?*

Response

The Mayor advised that Mr Crawford was welcome to make contact with the Chief Executive Officer to make arrangements for meeting in this regard.

**10. MOTIONS****MOTION 1 MR G GEAR, ALFRED COVE**

At 7.54pm – moved Mr G Gear, Alfred Cove, seconded Mr A Pollard, Mt Pleasant

**Motion**

**That the Council notes that the ratepayers strongly disagree with the potential loss of this Reserve and the designated land use of which it holds, and would like the Council to retain the Mount Pleasant Bowling Club and premises for the benefit of the community.**

At 7.55pm the Mayor submitted the motion, which was declared

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**9.11 Mr A Booth, Ardross**Question

Is the drainage reserve part of the Bowling Club site or is it separately site owned by the City?

Response

The Chief Executive Officer advised that the drainage reserve is separate to the Bowling Club site. However it would be considered for amalgamation if the proposal was to move forward and drainage alternatives would be considered.

**MOTION 2**

At 7.55pm – moved Mr J Sendzcuk, seconded Mr M Lee, Ardross

**That if this project does go ahead that no less than 30% of the land remains recreational and that any of the buildings are not higher than two stories.**

At 8.01pm the Mayor submitted the motion, which was declared

LOST

At 7.59pm – Mr N McKay foreshadowed the following motion

**MOTION 3**

8.01pm moved Mr N McKay, Ardross, seconded Mr H Arnold, Booragoon

**That the Council should consider alternative proposals for, community, recreation and leisure use of the Mt Pleasant Bowling Club site that is compatible with the current Ardross environment.**

At 8.05pm the Mayor submitted the motion, which was declared

LOST

**11. CLOSURE**

There being no further business, His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, declared the meeting closed at 8.05pm.