

**MINUTES**

**OF THE**

**SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS**

**HELD IN THE**

**MAIN HALL, MELVILLE CIVIC CENTRE**

**AT 6.30PM ON**

**MONDAY**

**17 AUGUST 2015**



**MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS HELD IN THE MAIN HALL,  
MELVILLE CIVIC CENTRE, 10 ALMONDBURY ROAD, BOORAGOON, COMMENCING  
6.30PM ON MONDAY, 17 AUGUST 2015.**

**1. OFFICIAL OPENING**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, welcomed Ratepayers and Electors of the City of Melville and opened the meeting at 6.30pm.

His Worship the Mayor advised the meeting had been called to discuss Roe 8 and the Perth Freight Link and the impacts to City of Melville Residents and that no other matter could be addressed at this meeting.

**2. PRESENT**

His Worship the Mayor R Aubrey

**COUNCILLORS**

Deputy Mayor Cr N Foxtan  
Cr M Reynolds  
Cr R Aubrey, Cr D Macphail  
Cr C Robartson, Cr R Willis  
Cr J Barton, Cr S Taylor-Rees  
Cr P Phelan  
Cr N Pazolli

**WARD**

University  
University  
City  
Bull Creek/Leeming  
Bicton/Attadale  
Palmyra/Melville/Willagee  
Applecross/Mount Pleasant

**IN ATTENDANCE**

Dr S Silcox  
Mr M Tieleman  
Ms L Hartill  
Mr J Christie  
Mr S Cope  
Mr L Hitchcock  
Mr J Clark

Mr N Fimmano

Chief Executive Officer  
Director Corporate Services  
A/Director Community Development  
Director Technical Services  
Director Urban Planning  
Executive Manager Legal Services  
Governance & Compliance Program  
Manager  
Governance & Property Officer

**Representatives from Main Roads**

Mr M Hazebroek  
Ms N Walton

Mr C Rickard

Senior Project Director  
Executive Director, Strategy and  
Communications  
Community Relations Manager

There were 179 Electors of the City of Melville in attendance.

**3. APOLOGIES**

Nil.

**4. LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Cr C Schuster – Applecross/Mount Pleasant

**5. INTRODUCTION OF ELECTED MEMBERS AND OFFICERS**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, introduced individual Elected Members and Senior Staff to the meeting.

**6. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST****6.1 FINANCIAL INTERESTS**

Nil.

**6.2 DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST THAT MAY CAUSE A CONFLICT**

Nil.

## **7. BUSINESS**

### **7.1 NOTICE OF SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS**

The following Notice of Meeting was advertised in the West Australian Newspaper on Saturday, 1 August 2015, and the Melville Times Community Newspaper on Tuesday, 4 August 2015 in addition to being displayed on public notice boards at all the City of Melville libraries and the Civic Centre. The notice read:

### **“Special Meeting of Electors**

**Monday, 17 August 2015**

A Special Meeting of Electors of the City of Melville will be held at the Civic Centre, 10 Almondbury Road, Booragoon commencing at 6.00pm for 6.30pm on Monday 17 August 2015 to consider a request signed by 166 electors to discuss -

Roe 8 and the Perth Freight Link and the impacts to City of Melville residents and ratepayers.

Should you require further information, please contact Corporate Support on 9364 0607.

Electors and Ratepayers of the City are welcome to attend. Registration will be available from 6.00pm. The Council Meeting Schedule, Agendas and Minutes of all meetings are available at [www.melvillecity.com.au](http://www.melvillecity.com.au)

**Dr Shayne Silcox**  
**Chief Executive Officer”**

## **7.2 MANNER OF CONDUCT OF THE MEETING**

Mr L Hitchcock, Executive Manager Legal Services read out the Manner of Conduct of the Meeting.

1. Toilets are located in the foyer up the stairs and an accessible toilet is available to the right side of the stage.
2. All present are required to sign the attendance register at the entry to the Main Hall.
3. Speakers must be Electors or Ratepayers of the City of Melville.
4. The Minutes of this meeting will include a summary of any questions asked and a summary of the response provided.
5. No audio or visual recording is to be undertaken without the permission of the Presiding Member.
6. Speakers are asked to clearly give their name and address each time they speak.
7. Upon a motion being proposed, each speaker is to address the Chair.
8. All addresses are to be limited to a maximum of five (5) minutes. Extension of time is permissible only with the agreement of a simple majority of Electors present (9.6 of Standing Orders).
9. No persons are to use offensive or objectionable expressions in reference to any Member, employee of the Council, or any other person (8.3 of Standing Orders).
10. No person observing a meeting is to create a disturbance at a meeting, by interrupting or interfering with the proceedings, whether by expressing approval or dissent, by conversing or by any other means. (8.8 of Standing Orders).
11. All Elected Members attend this meeting to observe the proceedings and hear comments from Electors. The purpose thereof is in order to enable the Elected Members to make an informed decision when any resolution, passed at this meeting by the electors, is presented to them at future Council Meeting for consideration.
12. Any decision that may be made by Elected Members at such future meeting is made on all relevant, (at the time of the meeting) information.
13. All questions should be directed to the Mayor who may invite a response from the Chief Executive Officer, Directors or Elected Members.

## 8. PRESENTATIONS

### Electors of the City of Melville

The following Electors gave presentations to the meeting.

**Mr R Short, Special Electors Meeting Lead Petitioner (Introduction)**

**Mr D Smirke (Impacts to Property in the Community)**

**Mr K Dravniek (Impacts to Health and Environment in the Community)**

**Ms L O'Malley (Impacts to Schools and Care Facilities in the Community)**

**Mr J Hilton (Conclusion)**

### Main Roads

**Mr M Hazebroek and Ms N Walton gave a presentation on behalf of Main Roads**

### City of Melville

**The Director Technical Services, Mr J Christie gave a presentation on behalf of the City of Melville.**

## 9. QUESTIONS

The Executive Manager Legal Services read out questions that had been received in writing prior to the meeting and invited Dr Shayne Silcox, Chief Executive Officer, to read out the City's responses.

### **Ms F De Campi - Willagee**

#### Question 1

*Firstly, has the Mayor and Councillors considered the impact on traffic with regards to access, congestion, pollution and safety in Willagee if the 2nd section of the Perth Freight Link goes ahead through Stock Road to Leach Highway?*

#### Response

Yes, the Council is aware of the potential impacts in Willagee should the proposed Stage 2 alignment proceed. When considering these impacts, the Council resolved to support the extension of Roe Highway between Kwinana Freeway and Stock Road, and additionally supports the extension of Roe Highway, west of Stock Road to Stirling Highway, utilising the alignment of the Fremantle Eastern Bypass for the Perth Freight Link, with all or part of the route tunnelled to minimise any potential impact.

### Question 2

*The second part of my question also considers the impact on our community if those same roads mentioned above are blocked by the Perth Freight Link.*

*Has any thought at all been given by the Mayor and the City of Melville on how the building of the Perth Freight Link will impact the social, cultural and economic nature of Willagee and its amenities as detailed below?*

### Response

Yes, the Council is aware of the potential impacts on the residents and the amenity in Willagee should the proposed stage 2 alignment proceed. The Council does not support the proposed Stage 2 alignment for the Perth Freight Link and has resolved to support the extension of Roe Highway between Kwinana Freeway and Stock Road, and additionally supports the extension of Roe Highway, west of Stock Road to Stirling Highway, utilising the alignment of the Fremantle Eastern Bypass for the Perth Freight Link, with all or part of the route tunnelled to minimise any potential impact.

### **Mr J Cooke, Palmyra**

### Question 1

*Why is the City of Melville disregarding what is being said about the Perth Freight Link by the eminent Professor of Sustainability Peter Newman?*

### Response

The City has considered all possible available information, including the information provided within the scope of the Newman report.

### Question 2

*Which independent professional is the City of Melville taking its advice from?*

### Response

The City's officers and Council have considered all possible available information and continue to do so.

### Question 3

*Will City of Melville allow a "right of reply" to be posted to all residents addressing the points promoted on the recent Perth Freight Link leaflet? If not, why not?*

### Response

The City of Melville Council has a clear and resolved position.

The City supports the extension of Roe Highway between Kwinana Freeway and Stock Road, and additionally supports the extension of Roe Highway, west of Stock Road to Stirling Highway, utilising the alignment of the Fremantle Eastern Bypass for the Perth Freight Link, with all or part of the route tunnelled to minimise any potential impact.

**Ms D Corbyn – Willagee**Question 1

*The northern suburbs have Kings Park. We southerners have the Beeliar Regional Park. Back in the 90s Melville Council worked hard to add in our Melville lakes, that is Blue Gum, Booragoon and Piney, so why does the Council now want to see the heart ripped out of Beeliar Regional Park? Will we all fit into Wireless Hill?*

Response

The City of Melville is committed to environmental conservation balanced with the ensuring liveability and amenity for all citizens.

**Ms J Mills – Bull Creek**Question 1

*How many of the Councillors are aware that the south west of WA is a world bio diversity hotspot. One of 25 in the world and the top hotspot in Australia. How can Politicians continue to destroy our heritage bushland which is the key to maintaining a unique biodiversity which makes our area worth living in?*

Response

The City is aware of the significance of the area, however the impact, risk and implication of the proposed alignment needs to be addressed by the Western Australian Environmental Protection Authority.

**Mr W Green – Bull Creek**Question 1

*Have you read page three of today's West Australian? Do you understand the safety presented?*

Response

For the information of the meeting, page 3 of today's West Australian has an article relating to the Transport Workers Union coming out in support for the Freight Link. The City is aware of the safety concerns associated with the road network.

**Mr C Omodei – Palmyra**Question 1

*Given the 2013-2014 Port is operating at 700 thousand TEU'S and heavy vehicles over Stirling bridge is 3400 per day, if the Port was to go to 1.400,000 TEUS in 2025-2027 the heavy vehicles over Stirling Bridge would then be 6800 per day. What are your thoughts on the 42% leakage of heavy vehicles 2856 per day from the Perth Freight Link which would leak through the City of Melville?*



Response

Mr M Hazebroek and Ms N Walton, Main Roads responded.

This is a highly conservative figure that was used when the business case was put together to determine what the cost benefits were for the project. That 42%, in reality, is probably likely to be lower once the trucking industry sees what the benefits of the Perth Freight Link are and once they have to pay the heavy vehicle charge, they would still be recouping more of the benefit in reduced travel times, reduced congestion and reduced operating costs for their vehicles. The 42% is at this stage only a theoretical number.

The 42% was a conservative number for an investment business case to enable sound investment decisions. That figure was taken from benchmark projects in the eastern states on unregulated freight route. We know that we can regulate this route and therefore the leakage is likely to be significantly lower.

**Mr M Pearson – Bull Creek**Question 1

*Why are we not learning from the example of places like Vancouver which has adopted rail where possible? This has resulted in less pollution and a much more people friendly city?*

Response

Perth is a new city that is yet to establish its road network. Until that is completed, problems with congestion are to be expected. So, completion of the road network is a priority and this includes the network through to the port, the outer port and the Latitude 32 Industry Zone.

Short-haul rail is currently not economically viable as it is subsidised at \$40.00 TEU and 97% of the containers are unpacked in the metropolitan area. The direct impact on residents of 30% of containers on rail through the City of Fremantle is not desirable.

The City supports development of transport infrastructure as part of the overall transport network.

His Worship the Mayor invited questions from the meeting floor.

**Mr R Renton – Bicton**Question 1

*I would ask the Mayor – do you have figures on the proportion of your constituency - the broader ratepayers and residents of Melville who support this project and those who are against it?*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

A complete City survey with regard to this particular alignment has not been undertaken. When the retention of Fremantle Eastern Bypass was being considered some 13 years ago 9,000 submissions in support were received, of these 6,500 were from residents of the City of Melville.

Approximately seven years ago a stratified sample of 400 residents were contacted via telephone for a survey and 83% of the participants believed the Bypass should have been constructed.

Question 2

*If you do not have those figures how can you justify spending ratepayers money on supporting the project?*

*You cannot drive an underground tunnel through White Gum Valley because its sand so if you are going to build a tunnel through White Gum Valley you are going to have to open it. And that is going to require a huge number of houses to be demolished.*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

The Council has voted in favour of the alignment as it is seen to take traffic away from the intersection of Stock Road and Leach Highway on a route free of traffic signals utilising the former Eastern Bypass Alignment and the tunnel to avoid any impact on residents as much as much as could be achieved in that area.

**Mr W Green - Bull creek**Question 1

*When did you first stand up Lord Mayor and say this has to stop? What year was it?*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

It would have been about 2001 when I was chair of the Technical Services Committee at the City of Melville.

Question 2

*A small container of 6 metres (20feet) what is the weight maximum for that container?*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

28 tonnes.

Question 3

*Do you think it's necessary to get cars away from these heavy trucks?*

Response

The article in today's West Australian (page 3) highlights the concern of the Transport Workers Union that the traffic mix along with other factors such as traffic signal behaviours result in a toxic mix that leads to dangerous situation on our roads.

In many instances long-haul trucks are entering the City and navigating through 14 sets of traffic lights in a relatively short span of roadway. This practice should not continue.

**Ms L O'Malley – Palmyra**Question 1

*How many placarded trucks LPG, Petroleum and the like, currently travel through the City of Melville? Will all placarded trucks be permitted through the tunnel if that option is chosen?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

I currently don't have the statistics on the number of placarded trucks that travel through the City of Melville. If the tunnel option is the successful route, it will be designed for placarded loads. However whether or not placarded loads will be permitted to use the tunnel will be determined through a risk assessment to determine the best option of those loads utilising the tunnel or travelling along the existing road network (Stock Road, Leach Highway and High Street). There are benefits, advantages and disadvantages in both options. In either scenario, LPG tankers will not be permitted through the tunnel.

His Worship the Mayor also responded.

The figure that was given was that there will be 2,000 trucks off Leach Highway by 2031.

The Chief Executive Officer responded.

The City of Melville has a number of commercial and industrial properties and these are serviced by freight trucks. It is impractical believe that all trucks will be removed from Melville roads, because of the need to service commercial and industrial operations.

**Ms T Smirke- Palmyra**Question 1

*Will you Mayor Aubrey still push and give your support for the entire Perth Freight Link to be built if only option one – the bulldozing of my home is possible for stage 2?*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

I am obliged to support the Council's decision at that stage – the option of continuing west across Stock Road is the preferred option of Council at the moment and I am fully supportive of that.

It is a priority for the City to avoid the loss of property, the demolition of property, the segregation of properties from their clients and commercial operations and a loss of jobs

If the tunnel option is not successful along an approximate alignment with the Eastern Bypass then the City would consider the option with the least impact on the City of Melville community.

That is the demolition of properties is a worst case scenario and should be avoided at all costs.

**Ms G O'Donovan - Applecross**Question 1

The amount of information on the website is disgraceful and from all levels of Government you need to learn as Politicians that we don't like propoganda and we don't like spin. Give us information, give us referenced sources. Give us things we can look at and see.

*Do you get it yet that you need to give us adequate information Mr Mayor?*

Response

The Chief Executive Officer responded.

The pamphlet is intending to provide an overview of the City's position along with a link to the City's website where further, more detailed, information can be found.

The City has resolved to allocate \$50,000 to communicate and educate the community on the Roe 8 project, to ensure there is broad community knowledge of the project and that interested parties are able to access information as it becomes available in order to be fully informed.

Once the Bypass alignment has been determined, the Council will resolve its position and the City will then be in a position to provide information and access to information relating to its position.

His Worship the Mayor responded.

The City of Melville's report is by far the most comprehensive report written by any affected Local Government and takes into account the impacts on other local authorities. The Chief Executive Officer and his officers were committed to ensuring our Councillors had all the information in front of them when they made that decision.

**Mr S Keppert -Bicton**

Question 1

*You said that 2,000 trucks per day will come off Leach Highway and surrounding roads if the Perth Freight Link was to go ahead. For how many years into the future do you think that there will be fewer trucks on Leach Highway?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

The proposed 2,000 trucks off Leach Highway is a point in time and it is realistic to assume that that figure will change over time. This information is based on current traffic modelling and can only predict to a certain point in the future. Any increases in truck traffic will be related to the amount of freight going through the Port and the construction of the Perth Freight Link will divert future freight traffic off Leach Highway.

**Mr D Mulroney - Palmyra**

Question 1

*What has this council been doing for the last 12 years, 10 years or 6 years? (Since this Government came to power) about getting the movement of the major traffic and the major growth of traffic out of Fremantle Port to Kwinana to the outer harbour to Latitude 32, where it can be controlled and separated from the population?*

*What are we doing to promote the building of the outer harbour, about protecting our roads and suburbs from these dangerous and hazardous chemicals that are currently being driven through the middle of them. Tell us what have you been doing to promote this?*

Response

His Worship the Mayor responded.

The City has been lobbying Federal and State Government to provide funding towards initiatives that will decrease the number of trucks on our residential roads.

My concern is with the accidents and pollution that we have to put up with on a daily basis. The congestion in the City has become a more significant issue with the construction of the Fiona Stanley Hospital.

The City is supporting Roe 8 as part of the long term solutions to traffic congestion, which also includes freight to rail and outer harbour.

**Ms A Nicholson – Booragoon**Question 1

*You mentioned in your slides that 400 hectares of land will be used as an environmental offset for the destruction that you will be doing to the wetlands. Can you please let us know where that 400 hectares is located?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

The offset land location is yet to be determined however we know the size of the parts of land and have determined the values of the land.

**Mr T Stokes – Kardinya**Question 1

*Have Main Roads and the City of Melville taken into consideration Roe 8 becoming WA's first toll road? and if Roe 8 becomes a first privatised toll road even initially on heavy haulage, which organisation has the maintenance contracts of Roe 8 then onwards?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

At the moment it's proposed that only a heavy vehicle charge will apply, which will affect the freight industry, not all vehicles, but that's a matter for Government Policy.

Main Roads will retain ownership of the road network for the foreseeable future, in which case, Main Roads will continue to operate and maintain the network. At some point the government may decide to sell off the rights enabling a private company to come in and take the heavy vehicle charge and operate the network on the Government's behalf.

His Worship the Mayor responded

It's a cost benefit to community in that the freight industry will be paying the tolls for using it and not the car users as we would assume that truck drivers who pay the toll will be accessing the port with containers.

**Mr L Griffiths- Bull Creek**Question 1

*How can 2-5000 trucks travel through a wetland without making any noise, without dropping any fuel, with dropping any heavy metals?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

All the issues that have been raised were addressed in the Public Environmental Review. That was undertaken by the South Metro Connect team from 2009 onwards. There were many submissions that were put forward by members of the public and key stakeholders that raised a whole number of issues to do with mitigating the environmental impacts. It was all addressed by the EPA and the EPA has made its decision that it is environmentally acceptable to build the project.

**Mr S Whisson – Kardinya**Question 1

*We keep hearing that this Roe Highway is six lanes, all maps show it's only four lanes. Can you enlighten us on that?*

Response

Mr M Hazebroek, Main Roads responded.

Yes it's four lanes.

**10. MOTIONS**

The following motion was put forward by Electors of the City of Melville.

At 8.45pm Ms J Watson of Palmyra moved, seconded Ms K Dravnieks -

**The Special Electors meeting request The City of Melville to withdraw its support for Roe 8 and the Perth Freight Link until it undertakes a new open and transparent community consultation on the Perth Freight Link with residents and ratepayers to establish their views.**

At 8.55pm the Mayor submitted the motion, which was declared

**CARRIED**

**11. CLOSURE**

There being no further business, His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, declared the Meeting closed at 8.56pm.