

**MINUTES  
OF THE  
SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS  
HELD IN THE  
MAIN HALL, MELVILLE CIVIC CENTRE  
AT 6.30PM ON  
7 OCTOBER 2010**



**MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS HELD IN THE MAIN HALL,  
MELVILLE CIVIC CENTRE, 10 ALMONDBURY ROAD, BOORAGOON, COMMENCING  
AT 6.39PM ON THURSDAY 7 OCTOBER 2010.**

---

**OPENING**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, welcomed those in attendance to the meeting and declared the meeting open at 6.39pm.

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, read aloud the Affirmation of Civic Duty and Responsibility.

**Affirmation of Civic Duty and Responsibility**

**I make this Affirmation in good faith on behalf of Elected Members and Officers of the City of Melville. We collectively declare that we will duly, faithfully, honestly, and with integrity fulfil the duties of our respective office and positions for all the people in the district according to the best of our judgement and ability. We will observe the City's Code of Conduct and Standing Orders to ensure the efficient, effective and orderly meeting within this forum.**

**1. PRESENT**

His Worship the Mayor Russell Aubrey

**COUNCILLORS**

Cr C Robartson  
Cr N Pazolli, Cr P Reidy  
Cr A Nicholson, Cr A Ceniviva  
Cr J Barton  
Cr C Halton  
Cr N Foxton

Bull Creek/Leeming  
Applecross/Mount Pleasant  
City  
Bicton/Attadale  
Palmyra/Melville/Willagee  
University

## **2. IN ATTENDANCE**

Dr S Silcox	Chief Executive Officer
Mr M Tieleman	Director Corporate Services
Mr S Cope	Director Urban Planning
Mr J Christie	Director Technical Services
Ms C Young	Director Community Development
Mr J Clark	Governance & Compliance Program Manager
Mr R Bailey	Special Projects Officer Engineering Design
Mr M Spencer	A/Manager Strategic Planning
Mr D Vinicombe	Manager Planning & Development Services
Ms D Beilby	Minute Secretary
Ms J Paparella	A/Business Support Officer

There were 86 Electors of the City of Melville, two non Electors and one member from the press in attendance.

## **3. APOLOGIES**

Cr R Subramaniam (Deputy Mayor) - Bull Creek/Leeming  
Cr M Reynolds – University Ward  
Mr Craig Quartermaine of Alfred Cove  
Mrs Barbara Spaziani of Booragoon  
Mr Laurie Spaziani of Booragoon

## **4. LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Cr G Wieland – Bicton/Attadale Ward  
Cr B Kinnell – Palmyra/Melville/Willagee Ward

## **5. INTRODUCTION OF ELECTED MEMBERS AND OFFICERS**

His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, introduced individual Elected Members and Senior Staff to the meeting.

**6. BUSINESS****6.1 NOTICE OF SPECIAL MEETING OF ELECTORS**

The following Notice of Meeting was advertised in the West Australian Newspaper on Wednesday, 15 September 2010 and the Melville Times Community Newspaper on Tuesday 21 September 2010 in addition to being displayed on public notice boards at all the City of Melville libraries and the Civic Centre. The notice read:

**“Special Meeting of Electors****Thursday, 7 October 2010**

A Special Meeting of Electors of the City of Melville will be held in the Main Hall of the Civic Centre, 10 Almondbury Road, Booragoon commencing at 6.30pm on Thursday, 7 October 2010 to consider a request signed by 627 electors to discuss -

**Western Power’s expansion of their electricity network in the City of Melville**

The Elected Members and staff welcome your questions regarding the City of Melville or any matter relating to the Notice of Meeting. A question form can be obtained from the City of Melville website [www.melvillecity.com.au](http://www.melvillecity.com.au) or please contact Denise Beilby on 9364 0607 for alternative arrangements.

In order for complex questions to be answered at the meeting, questions must be received by 5.00pm on Monday 4 October 2010.

**Dr Shayne Silcox  
Chief Executive Officer”**

His Worship the Mayor read out the Manner of Conduct of the Meeting.

## **6.2 MANNER OF CONDUCT OF THE MEETING**

1. All present are required to sign the attendance register at the entry to the Main Hall.
2. Speakers must be Electors of the City of Melville.
3. The proceedings are being taped for the purpose of production of the minutes and speakers are requested to use the microphones each time they speak.
4. No other audio or visual recording is to be undertaken without the permission of the Presiding Member.
5. Speakers are asked to clearly give their name and address each time they speak.
6. Upon a motion being proposed, each speaker is to address the Chair.
7. All addresses are to be limited to a maximum of five (5) minutes. Extension of time is permissible only with the agreement of a simple majority of Members present (9.6 of Standing Orders).
8. No persons are to use offensive or objectionable expressions in reference to any Member, employee of the Council, or any other person (8.3 of Standing Orders).

## **7. PRESENTATION OF THE COMMUNITY PLANNING SCHEME NO. 5 AND PLANNING PROVISIONS CONCERNING ELECTRICITY SUBSTATIONS**

The Director Urban Planning, Mr S Cope presented a summary of process and planning provisions concerning electricity substations based on review of relevant planning bulletins.

## **8. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

### Disclosure of Interest

Elected Member/Officer	Cr N Pazolli
Type of Interest	Interest under Code of Conduct
Nature of Interest	Family member is employed by Western Power
Request	To stay
Decision of Council	Not Applicable

### Disclosure of Interest

Elected Member/Officer	Cr A Nicholson
Type of Interest	Interest under Code of Conduct
Nature of Interest	Nephew is employed by Western Power
Request	To stay
Decision of Council	Not Applicable

### Disclosure of Interest

Elected Member/Officer	Dr S Silcox
Type of Interest	Interest under Code of Conduct
Nature of Interest	Was a previous employee of Western Power
Request	To stay
Decision of Council	Not Applicable

## **8. GENERAL BUSINESS**

### **8.1 INTRODUCTION/OVERVIEW ON BEHALF OF ELECTORS**

By Kevin Wringe of Ardross gave an introduction on behalf of Electors.

### **8.2 NOMINATED SPEAKERS FOR ELECTORS –**

The following speakers presented to the meeting on behalf of Electors.

Power substations in residential areas	Eigil (Ike) Nielsen
Prudent avoidance	Kevin Wringe
Bicton Park	John Backhouse
Letter from resident M Davis	Nancy Nielsen
Summary	Kevin Wringe

**8.3 TABLING OF MOTIONS**

His Worship the Mayor called for a seconder to the motions moved by Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross.

**Motion 1**

At 7.21pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Mr Eigil Nielsen of Booragoon -

**That the Council does not support any applications from Western Power or similar agencies:**

- (a) To expand the capacity or otherwise of the existing Myaree power substation on the corner of Kitchener and Norma Roads, Booragoon.**
- (b) To build and/or operate a power substation on the property 58-60 Murray Road, Bicton also known as "Bicton Park" spanning from Murray Road to Fifth Street.**

At 7.23pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**Motion 2**

At 7.24pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Ms Gay Jeffreys of Alfred Cove -

**That the Council supports the community's objective in ensuring that the existing Myaree power substation on the corner of Kitchener and Norma Roads, Booragoon is relocated to an industrial area followed by the decommissioning of the existing substation.**

At 7.25pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**Motion 3**

At 7.25pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Mr Royce Carrigg of Bicton -

**That the Council supports the community and asks Western Power to find alternative sites for power substations within industrial areas, without further delay.**

At 7.26pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**Motion 4**

At 7.26pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Mr Eigil Nielsen of Booragoon –

**That the Council:**

- 1. Demands the urgent relocation of overhead High Voltage Power Lines and that defined easements and safety zones must be strictly adhered to, especially in proximity to residential housing, schools and kindergartens.**
- 2. Support, if necessary, the locating of overhead High Voltage Power lines underground.**

At 7.27pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**Motion 5**

At 7.27pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Mr John Backhouse of Bicton -

**That the Council provide endorsement and active advocacy to secure “Bicton Park” as property of the City of Melville, and to be kept as public open space in perpetuity.**

At 7.28pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**Motion 6**

At 7.28pm Mr Kevin Wringe of Ardross moved, seconded Mr Jim Gianfrancesco of Bicton -

**That the Council undertake active advocacy to work with Western Power, other relevant government bodies and the local community on a suitable land swap solution, as a means to achieve motion 5.**

At 7.28pm The Mayor submitted the motion which was declared

**CARRIED UNANAMOUSLY**

**8.4 OPEN COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS FROM ELECTORS****Prior Written Questions to the City of Melville**

At 7.30pm His Worship the Mayor, R Aubrey, advised the meeting that no written questions had been received.



### **Questions from the Meeting Floor**

At 7.31pm His Worship the Mayor invited open comments and questions from the floor.

#### Questions – Mr Cecil Walkley of Bicton

1. *“Has Western Power been invited to attend this meeting”.*
2. *“Why is there no representative from Western Power, this a well attended meeting and I think there should be someone here.”*

#### Response – Mr Eigil Nielsen of Booragoon

*“Deliberately we did ask when we did the submission for the petition that Western Power not be allowed to do any presentations as such, because I think by 27 November, 2 March and 27 May up here we had seen enough presentations. This is an Electors meeting, it is for us to have our say to our representatives of this City and not to get into a fight with Western Power, because at the moment we are obviously poles apart. We have said that Western Power is welcome to attend and sit down and listen and be part of it, there are no problems with that, but this is an Electors meeting not a presentation for Western Power.”*

The Mayor added that he understood Western Power representatives were in attendance however Mr Nielsen made the request that they not speak.

## **8.5 COMMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND COUNCILLORS**

#### Cr Pazolli

Cr Pazolli asked for a show of hands of those present who would consider paying a differential rate to offset the purchase cost of acquiring the land currently owned in Bicton by Western Power for Public Open Space should a land swap solution not materialise. Approximately one third of those present supported the proposal.

#### Mr Jim Gianfrancesco of Bicton

- “1. *I understand the City of Melville does hold quite a few parcels of land. They may not be a direct swap but they may be compatible, size wise land wise, value wise. Say they have 30 parcels of land if its not a direct swap them maybe there are other suitable arrangements that could be made.*
2. *After having incurred the investment loss of the City of Melville which is often referred to as a paper loss, this would be a very small proportion of that, about 10%. I would say we have already incurred a fair loss as it is and this would be minuscule compared to that.”*

The Chief Executive Officer responded to Mr Gianfrancesco's second comment.

*"There has been a lot of information written about this that a number of it is incorrect. There have been some Collateral Debt Obligations (CDO) investments, we have not invested in sub prime as a Council. The investment is a book loss and as I have tried to explain before, it is like your superannuation. Most of us took a hit with our super funds and as long as we don't sell the shares we don't incur the loss. The CDOs are not quite like that, but essentially the market place has improved, so currently the book loss is around \$15.5 million not \$20 million, but in the last five years we have also earned \$15.5 million in interest.*

*All of the CDOs barr the Lehman Brothers, which was some \$5million, are still paying interest. All CDOs at this stage are still paying interest albeit that some are getting marginal My view is that there will be some CDO losses, there won't be anywhere near \$20 million or \$15 million in that is my guess as we move forward. Additionally the money is in reserves, the reserves are for specific purposes. I am more than happy to talk to any resident who wants to come and get detail from me rather than look at what is in the media. We have some \$650 million worth of assets so we need to put money away to replace those assets in the future and that is what these are for because our borrowing capacity as a Council is around \$50 million. We can't actually borrow enough money to replace some of these assets and hence why we put the money away in reserves. It does not affect the operational day to day running and our ongoing budgets, it's only when you need the money in the future whether the money is available. I can tell you at this stage that the Council, through a number of activities that it has put in place, has virtually recovered the reserves back to their pre impairment levels now, so we are hoping that it goes forward and you will find that there are no losses. I think that would be wishful thinking, but I don't think you will find the losses are anywhere near the scare campaign that is out there."*

His Worship the Mayor added -

Nonetheless there is no budget for the purchase of this parkland so whether we get this money back or not it was never part of a budget for the purchase of this land.

Cr Halton

*"I would like to thank everyone for coming and drawing the attention of the Council to the concerns and also the way you have gone about it, but I would just like to say regarding any special area rate or anything like that, to me that is speculation at this stage. What the Council will do is what is proposed here which is to investigate land swaps and those sorts of issues and at this point in time worrying about that sort of thing is completely premature."*

Cr Barton

*"Thank you for coming this evening and I think it has been made abundantly clear we have had further information with regards to the problems associated with this and I must say that as a Councillor for Bicton/Attadale you have my full support and I would not be in favour, and I will state that now, of any rate increase for Bicton and Attadale alone and Myaree and Booragoon because if this occurred, this would be an asset for the whole of the City and I believe that the whole of the City, like we have always done, should be paying for it."*

Wayne Lamb of Bicton

*"I live two doors from the park. In response to the Councillors question, I know people that come from up to two kilometres away to use our park, they bring their kids there because it is a nice quiet safe park so to come up with a question like am I willing, because I live two doors away, to put my hand in my pocket, are you going to ask someone that lives two kilometres away under the City of Melville to put their hand in their pocket. Just impossible, a logistical nightmare, you just wouldn't even go down that path. Where would you stop it. You would turn neighbour against neighbour. If there was a border, one house pays it the next doesn't, impossible."*

Vanessa Barnes of Alfred Cove

*"Getting back to the motions that we have been to, I want to know now where do we go to from here. We have all put our hands up, we've said we don't want it. I have two young children, my children go to school in the area. Where does it go from here. There is no formal submission is that correct, but I guess nip it in the bud now. Who makes the decision does this decision ride with the Councillors on what goes to the Planning Commission."*

His Worship the Mayor responded -

*"There is no application from Western Power at this stage so we may have a considerable wait from this time forward. These motions and the minutes of this meeting will go to the next Council meeting and they will be received by Council."*

*It is down to the Council to make a recommendation to the Planning Commission and the Planning Commission will have the final say on this item and that is because of the special powers they have."*

His Worship the Mayor read out the latest communication from the Western Power Website that the forecast initially from Western Powers anticipation, a solution was required before 2016 so I believe the solution means that they were going to actually construct before 2016. This date is now recognised as being after 2016 no precise date is yet known. So we are looking at least six years down the track before construction.

The solution is construction or the solution is to get an application approval?

The Chief Executive Officer responded -

*"The solution here is whatever the solution is whether it is to build on another location or the like but after 2016 they are looking at determining what the solution would be. The point I was trying to make was that there is no immediacy around this issue. Its not an immediate thing, don't expect an application tomorrow we are some six years away so we have got some time to try and resolve the issue and seek other solutions in that time."*

His Worship the Mayor added –

That doesn't limit the purpose of this meeting of course in terms of the momentum in the community and the requirement to express your concerns and for this Council to take those concerns on board.

Mr Eigil Nielsen of Booragoon responded -

*"I would just like to reply to that. As you know we received a letter in April last year, that's 18 months ago, telling us that they will come early next year during 2011 and bulldoze, demolish three perfect units and start to build and Myaree Substation will be finished by say late 2013. All of a sudden after 27 May there is a shift from Western Power in their pattern of dealing with the community, now all of a sudden its six years away. I am sorry I am not buying it."*

## **8.6 COMMENTS IN CONCLUSION BY ELECTORS**

By Kevin Wringe of Ardross

*"Thank you Mr Mayor, just very briefly. The 1000 signatures and peoples presence here tonight sends a strong message and request to you Mr Mayor and the City Councillors. The information pack and the presentations tonight were very clear, the six motions gained strong support so now in accordance with the Director Urban Planning tonight we ask that the City of Melville when it is making its recommendation in relation to the Western Power proposal which will come to your desk that you give active support to the electors six motions and their position and finally we thank you Mr Mayor and Councillors for your presence tonight for listening to us our information our concerns our options and the motions which were strongly endorsed and we trust that you will support we the electors on this very important issue."*

His Worship the Mayor responded -

The resolutions from this meeting will be reported to the Council and a full report will be presented at a later time. So over the next two months you will see this being received by the Council.

*"I have already thanked those people involved in preparing for this evening the community members but can I also thank the community for the well balanced way things have been presented tonight and the responses. I have always found that when there is a community issue the best results are achieved by working in collaboration with your Council. And I commend all those people that I have had contact with so far regarding this item in the way that they have conducted themselves and been well informed and understanding of the Council's somewhat limited powers on this item and I wish you all a very safe journey home."*

## **9. CLOSURE**

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was closed at 7.55pm.